Date: Wednesday 10th January 2018
Time: 13.30 – 16.30
Venue: University of Edinburgh
Resources: Available here

MINUTES:
Measuring Sustainability in the
Curriculum Workshop

Attendees:

Anita	Baggs	AB	Edinburgh College
Jackie	Beresford	JB	Dundee and Angus College
Beth	Brownlee	BB	West Lothian College
Craig	Cathcart	CC	Queen Margaret University
Pauline	Donaldson	PD	Forth Valley College
Alison	Duffy	AD	Abertay University
Rachel	Dunk	RD	Manchester Metropolitan University
Lina	Erlandsson	LE	Nottingham Trent University
Pete	Higgins	PH	The University of Edinburgh
Jennifer	Jamieson	JJ	Scottish Funding Council
Betsy	King	BK	Learning for Sustainability Scotland
Matthew	Lawson	ML	The University of Edinburgh
Suzanne	Marshall	SMa	College Development Network
Stewart	Miller	SMi	University of Glasgow
Severine	Monvoisin	SMo	Edinburgh College
Laura	Murray	LM	West Lothian College
Robbie	Nicol	RN	The University of Edinburgh
Kim	Reid	KR	Forth Valley College
Heather F.	Ross	HR	The University of Edinburgh
Valeria	Ruiz Vargas	VRV	Manchester Metropolitan University
Martin	Webb	MW	Edinburgh College
Rehema	White	RW	University of St Andrews
Matthew	Woodthorpe	MW	University of Stirling

Apologies:

Hannah	Biggs	University College London		Wilma	MacLeod	South Lanarkshire College
Sharon	Boyd	University of Edinburgh		Gregory	Mannion	University of Stirling
Alan	Britton	University of Glasgow		Mike	Pretious	Queen Margaret University
Paulo	Cruz	Glasgow Caledonian University		Katrina	Pugh	Edinburgh College
Leanne	Denby	Macquarie University		Katie	Ridley	Northumbria University
Wattala	Fernando	Edinburgh Napier University		Andrew	Samuel	Abertay University
Simon	Goldsmith	University of Greenwich		David	Stutchfield	University of St Andrews
Alison	Greig	Anglia Ruskin University		Joshua	West	University of Leeds
John	Macdonald	SRUC		John	Wincott	Fife College

SUMMARY OF RESOURCES

Setting the context for Sustainability in the Curriculum (SitC)

- Historical Development
  o Historical Development of LfS and SitC at St Andrews Presentation, Rehema White (LfSS & St Andrews) available here
- International Context
  o International Context for SitC Presentation, Betsy King (LfSS), available here
- UK context
  o The QAA guidance (2014) SitC document available here
  o UKSSD 'Driving action for the Sustainable Development Goals in the UK' page available here
- Scottish context
  o Scottish Context for SitC presentation, Rebecca Petford (EAUC-Scotland), available here
  o Green Salon Fife College case study here
  o Outcome Agreement Sustainability quote available here
- Considering Student Perspectives – Via Video
  o Video presentation from Rachel Drayson (NUS) available here
  o NUS Sustainability Survey Report available here

What is being done so far in Universities and Colleges?

- Requiring Demonstration of Alignment with ESD (and the WBFG Goals)
  o Video presentation from Carolyn Hayles (University of Wales Trinity St David) available here
  o Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 available here
- Auditing the ESD Content of Programmes
  o Auditing the ESD Content of Programmes presentation, Rachel Dunk and Valeria Vargas (MMU), available here
  o Carbon Literacy website available here
- The NUS Responsible Futures Approach
  o Video presentation from Quinn Runkle (NUS) available here
  o Responsible Futures website available here
  o NUS SDG teach-in detail available here

What can we learn from other approaches?

- GTCS Initial Teacher Education Course and Programme Reflection and Development Tool
  o General Teaching Council Scotland Initial Teacher Education Course website available here

- "Embedding Equality and Diversity in the Curriculum" resource by CDN
  o Learn Online platform available here
  o The Higher Education Academy Embedding Equality and Diversity in the Curriculum project available here

	SUMMARY OF DISCUSSIONS	ACTIONS
1	**WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS** *Rehema White, LfS Scotland and University of St Andrews* Everyone was welcomed to the event and invited to pause and celebrate the current progress and interest for Sustainability in the Curriculum (SitC). This session is aiming to push forward from this progress. Along with a drive to embed sustainability across the curriculum is a requirement for measuring it to ensure progress. However, this is met by concerns that any measuring framework may struggle to be inclusive of all aspects, due to the bredth of the subject and ways it can be embedded within the curriculum. It is noted that the recent inclusion of the necessity of students developing sustainability skills and understandings in the Scottish Funding Council Outcome Agreement Guidance provides motivation for SitC to gain higher prioritization within institutions. The aim of the workshop is to uncover what practical tools exist, what new ones might be required to progress, and also the theoretical direction that institutions wish to go. Attendees were asked to note their expectations of the workshop: • Sharing information on what's already happening / good practice and what has been tried that doesn't work for embedding and measuring sustainability in the curriculum, including useful tools for setting a baseline and measuring progress • To know where sustainability is best placed throughout the curriculum and how it can be tailored to different subjects • Discuss how to use measures and arguments to encourage decision makers to commit to and fund this work • Discuss how to make it meaningful without it being a tick-box exercise • Understanding models which measure the impact of SitC on student experience • Discuss measures which make sense to staff who are less sustainability literate • Engage around the differences between Scotland and England, in terms of ESD linked to difference in policy frameworks • Discuss the role of student unions/associations in leading progress • Find out what is needed to help take agenda forward in the FHE sector	
2	**SETTING THE CONTEXT FOR SUSTAINABILITY IN THE CURRICULUM** **Historical Development** *Rehema White, LfS Scotland and University of St Andrews* *Presentation available here (Slides 1-6)* SitC is not a new interest area but has been evolving over a long period. Ideas of general Sustainable Development arose around the 1960's, partly because of the 1962 *Silent Spring* by Rachel Carson which discussed human impacts on the environment. Following this, a series of human and natural crises such famines took place. For a while it looked like these two dialogs were running in parallel, but there was eventually recognition that they are interlinked. The Sustainable Development movement emerged as an answer to providing better explanations, and gave greater success to efforts on both sides. Once these opinions became mainstream a set of	

pedagogy and curricula emerged. However, there is still an incorrect preconception that sustainable development is just about the environment.

International Context
Betsy King, LfS Scotland
Presentation available here

A lot is happening on the international stage to push Sustainable Development. In 2015 the environment and social justice dialogues collided with the development of the United Nations Sustainability Development Goals (SDGs). This gave a framework for every government worldwide – a to do list of 17 goals for sustainability, with 169 targets associated with the goals.

One SDG specific to the cause of SitC is Goal 4 (Listed below and in slides), however education is key to addressing all 17 of goals.

Goal 4. Ensure quality education for all (10 targets)

4.7 Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship
By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

4.7.1 *Extent to which (i) global citizenship education and (ii) education for sustainable development, including gender equality and human rights, are mainstreamed at all levels in: (a) national education policies, (b) curricula, (c) teacher education and (d) student assessment*

This SDG is *the* hook to engage institutions in prioritizing sustainability in curriculum.

This is a complicated goal, with discussion ongoing on how to evidence that every country is achieving it. It is recognized internationally that this is difficult to pin down.

UNESCO has a group that are undertaking monitoring of Target 4, and releasing regular Global Education Monitoring (GEM) reports. The first report (2016) is an inspiring read that frames education in all sectors around the 5 Ps (People, planet, prosperity, partnership and peace). It gives targets that refer to all learners and all education levels including tertiary level. Within this the Indicators are still under discussion. Not every country gave data to be a part of this - the U.K did not contribute.

The latest report (GEM 2017) covers accountability, measurement and flagging up problems. Education Monitoring is seen as a shared responsibility between government, citizens, students, institutions, international organisations. These problems are different in different contexts due to different starting points and resources.

Scotland wants to flag that it is delivering on the Sustainable Development goals. It has gone through a slow process of looking at how the goals fit into the National

Performance Framework, which is still in the consultancy process. The Scottish Government are taking the SDGs seriously, and FHE are part of this process.

UK Context
Rehema White, LfS Scotland and University of St Andrews
Presentation available [here](#) (Slide 6)

Is it important to consider what are the UK requirements that we need to respond to, and what are the resources that can support the journey. The UK-wide view is generally that Scotland is far ahead of England in addressing sustainable development at a governmental level (as is Wales).

With regard to resources, The Quality Assurance Agency for Higher Education (QAA) and the Higher Education Academy (HEA) have given reports on SitC examples and case studies. The QAA guidance (2014) [ESD document](#) has been taken quite seriously by senior management in education, and contains valuable insights.

As there has not been much movement in the UK there are now efforts from grassroots organisations such as the UK Stakeholders for Sustainable Development (UKSSD) network, including an [Action Plan](#), to support a more activity.

The UK context can be quite useful to consider for documents and initiatives to become involved in.

Scottish Context
Rebecca Petford, EAUC-Scotland
Presentation available [here](#)

There are some guides about developing sustainable development in [particular courses](#) which was developed by EAUC-Scotland, however there is little guidance for embedding curricula-wide.

The updated Scottish Funding Council (SFC) Outcome Agreement Guidance (OA) requires institutions to develop their sustainability efforts, including ensuring students develop sustainability understandings and skills. The text is available [here](#). This has galvanized a lot of interest in the sector, with many reaching out to EAUC-Scotland to discuss actions for satisfying these new requirements. They are working with SFC closely and are hoping to increase this inclusion in OA's.

PBCCD ([Public Bodies Climate Change Duties](#)) reporting puts governmental pressure on institutions. ESD (Education for Sustainable Development) comes under the wider impact and influence section of the report. This is not a required section so this involves a push to get completed, and requires engagement and teaching staff to ensure those completing the report (usually in Estates) know what others are doing.

You can't manage if you don't measure. There is a lack of resources for and progress on embedding SitC as there is no effective way to prove the impact. For instance, within energy management you report to KPIs, and have a target. A way to measure would really assist in embedding SitC, and would allow SFC and senior management teams to increase their emphasis on this work.

Considering Student Perspectives – Via Video
Rachel Drayson, NUS
Video presentation available here

Student facing research on ESD has been carried out by NUS for the past 7 years. The methodology of this research is an online survey with 12,000 responses. The promotion avoided mentioning sustainability or sustainable development to capture a broad range of opinions and avoid skewing results towards those interested in SD.

The expectations section has a series of statements that participants voted on by level of agreement. Within this it is found that overall students report a strong expectation and desire for Learning for Sustainability. One example of this is that 87% of students in higher education believe that Sustainable Development is something which Universities and Colleges should actively incorporate and promote. More results are explained within the presentation.

The experiences from this survey assessed and measured interest in developing sustainability skills, attributes or understanding. The following report talks through results of the survey, giving insights into student feedback on their interaction with sustainable development through their education. This highlights gaps within education where this is not touched upon. It also gives insights into opinion on the importance of engaging students about sustainability to influence their long term attitudes and behaviors.

Group Discussions:
Why measure Sustainability in the Curriculum?
- Having data can win over institutions to provide more resources and support
- Students are interested in sustainability, and future employers need these skills, so having a way of measuring SitC will help institutions meet this need
- Embedding in courses means no extra employees for a separate course – but this misses the point and it's about ensuring all students have relevant sustainability training

Methodology Concerns

- There is a need to define sustainability to make it more tangible
- Measuring would need to be meaningful rather than tick box or audit
- There are different levels of intervention needed within the curriculum. Should we be measuring or trying to bring about culture change? There is a fear that simply measuring will not fix the problem

| 3 | WHAT IS BEING DONE SO FAR IN UNIVERSITIES AND COLLEGES? |

Requiring Demonstration of Alignment with ESD (and the WBFG Goals) – *Via Video*
Carolyn Hayles, University of Wales Trinity St David
Video presentation available here

UWTSD's sustainability journey started in 2012. The university is an old institution which has had a number of merges bringing together different institutions in recent years. They have a large local student population who intend to stay in Wales following graduation.

Wales has the Wellbeing of Future Generations (WBFG) Act (2015), which is considered at the heart of government thinking, and is often linked to the SDGs.
- A Globally Responsible Wales
- A Resilient Wales
- A Healthier Wales
- A More Equal Wales
- A Wales of Cohesive Communities
- A Wales of Vibrant Culture and Thriving Welsh Language
- A Prosperous Wales

Carolyn has been in post since 2015, in a role to support staff to embed sustainable development and the WBFG Act across curriculum in every subject. Sustainability is featured heavily in the University's strategic plan. All progress is reported to SMT.

The validation and re-validation of degree programmes has been revised to ensure that sustainability in included within the curriculum. Staff are asked to provide a statement on how sustainable development is included and their aims for sustainability within their degree programme.

There was originally a traditional style audit to uncover where sustainable development was embedded into curriculum, which gathered a baseline for future work. The project relies on the goodwill of academic staff to report on sustainable development in courses.

The university have since developed an independent online certificated course on sustainability, with classes taught from different disciplines, which was launched in September 2017. This is not just for students and academic staff but estates, hospitality etc., and is proving really popular. Even more students will be taking the course next year, as academic staff choose to write it into their programmes so all students have to attend.

An internal grant scheme was launched for teaching and learning activities for sustainability projects from any disciplines. These will be showcased in June 2019 at the HE and Sustainability conference, to be held in Swansea.

Carolyn is open to queries from any interested individuals. Please request her contact details here.

Auditing the ESD Content of Programmes
Rachel Dunk and Valeria Vargas, Manchester Metropolitan University
Presentation available here

The context in England is different from Scotland and Wales as it does not have strong government support. However, the city of Manchester has a strong identity around sustainability, and the University of Manchester has been in the top 5 Universities in the People and Planet ratings for the past 5 years. ESD is now a key component for People and Planet.

Activity 1: Curriculum auditing

The School of Science and the Environment was keen to embed ESD knowledge and skills, with the Aims and Objectives available on the slides.

They looked at pre-existing tools for auditing but none of them gave a holistic enough assessment, and some entailed a cost. The team decided to form their own auditing tool to ensure that the written curricula reflected what the courses actually teach.

From this they developed 25 SD themes, which were then grouped into 5 domains. These were applied with common sense and tailoring to each department to use associated language (e.g. diversity may appear as geographies of difference).

Their audit process will be made open access. The original project took 3 months, but now the initial work has been done to develop the tool it could take just one or two weeks to complete an audit.

Activity 2: Programme review

Discussions on sustainability were opened around the curriculum with course leaders during the curriculum review process. External assessors were advised that revised programme learning outcomes should be updated to reflect the inclusion.

The Carbon literacy Project have developed an additional tool that began in Manchester and has been adopted by Keep Scotland Beautiful. This may be valuable to look into as a model for teaching sustainability. The University of Manchester are training students to be trainers for other students in carbon literacy through ESD funding. The training increased confidence and improved employability, highlighted through interviews, and has been quite transformative for students. Large organisations are also taking on these courses for staff, and recognise this qualification as a valuable asset.

The NUS Responsible Futures Approach – *Via Video*
Quinn Runkle, NUS
Video presentation available here

Responsible Futures is a programme stemming from the need for students to leave education prepared to be part of a responsible future. The formal, informal and subliminal curriculum is looked at as influencers through the Responsible Futures programme. It is not a tick-box accreditation but a journey through the programme to attain the certification. Partnerships between Student Unions and institutions are key to progress the project. NUS facilitates and trains student auditors to measure impact and determine the accreditation level.

There are 27 partnerships currently in action, with channels for sharing best practice between participants. The programme has been effective in generating new activities along with measuring current activities, and highlights that it's not only knowledge that matters, but also skills and attributes.

There are case studies available in the presentation from:
- Nottingham Trent University around their new strategic plan "Creating the University of the Future", within which a core component is embedding future thinking into the curriculum.
- Kingston University around Graduate Attributes, which indirectly touch on ESD but can be seen as another way to frame this.

	• University of Winchester around a curriculum audit involving working with a team of students It is noted that the Responsible Futures website is a good source of information and examples. NUS have also launched their SDG Teach In, which will take place on the 19th-23rd February 2018. More information can be found here. **Linking to Institutional Sustainability Intentions** *Rehema White, University of St Andrews* *Presentation available here (Slides 7-23)* The University of St Andrews began their ESD work with starting an undergraduate SD module, followed by a whole undergraduate programme and now a postgraduate programme too. Across the institution there is large student and staff SD involvement, highlighted by the popularity of Transition University of St Andrews. The interest in SD encouraged the senior management team to look into becoming an institution which places particular emphasis on SD. They are in the process of shifting SD enthusiasm over to the curriculum. The approach to embedding ESD was slow due to lack of resource. A list of the different approaches which have been undertaken for measuring and embedding ESD are given within the presentation. The scoping activities highlighted a number of modules from curriculum leaders that were perhaps less likely sustainability champions (e.g. The Arts of Islam, Impact of Chemistry, Victorian Literature and Science). This was important in identifying the breadth of material currently being taught, but also to begin a conversation around this to encourage sustainability thinking, and find ways in. This process helped to build both top down and bottom up support for SitC. The timing for pushing this agenda is *right now*, not just because of the international restrictions, but because of changing attitudes and interest.	
4	**WHAT CAN WE LEARN FROM OTHER APPROACHES?** **GTCS Initial Teacher Education Course and Programme Reflection and Development Tool** *Betsy King, LfS Scotland* The General Teaching Council for Scotland set the professional standards for all teachers in Scotland. LfS was embedded in the standards that dictate every teacher's career from 2013. One of the implications for this is that teacher training – for both new and existing teachers – has to be preparing teachers to demonstrate ESD. Audits have their place, but they fail to help develop courses and programmes. It is highlighted that LfS isn't a block of content but more an approach, and audits fail to show this. A tool is being piloted to help lecturers in Initial Teacher Education reflect on what LfS means in existing courses and programmes, and think about what is needed when	

	developing new courses. The tool is available on the General Teaching Council for Scotland website <u>here</u>.	
	"Embedding Equality and Diversity in the Curriculum" resource by CDN *Suzanne Marshall, College Development Network*	
	There are a number of resources and courses available from CDN, many of which are free and accessible. There is a '<u>Learn Online</u>' section on their website that can be accessed by any ".ac.uk" email address	
	The Higher Education Academy, following the equality act, looked into embedding equality within the curriculum, with resources available <u>here</u>.	
	A framework to support the embedding of equality was developed by CDN for all staff within colleges (in a way which is transferable to universities). The framework is divided into 8 sections to give a whole organizational approach. There are examples given within this framework of good practice.	
	A framework is another approach we could consider for how to support institutions to embed ESD in the curriculum.	
5	**DEVELOPING WHOLE SECTOR STRATEGIES AND TOOLS** **Group Discussion Key Points** • Monitoring should not be a tick box exercise • Important that any ESD materials highlight potential benefits for institutions • Language in sustainability is important, as 'Sustainable living' might be relevant for core skills but 'Environmental sustainability' is more wider reaching • Colleges are in a difficult position to move ahead with ESD as students can be at very different levels, and a clear approach is necessary • It seems there are lots of tools available but deciding which to use and how can be confusing. A filter down list would be useful. • There are lots of requirements for reporting but no funding for actual actions • Staff development is a key element of progressing SitC. Professional Development needs funding to take this forward. The new Outcome agreements sustainability specification may allow for more funding to become available.	
6	**NEXT STEPS** **Rehema White, University of St Andrews** There is a possibility of forming a working group to help guide the next steps, which may include developing a framework and potentially writing an academic article to further the reach of the discussions. Interested parties should contact EAUC-Scotland on <u>scotland@eauc.org.uk</u>. The minutes and resources will be made available to all on the Sustainability Exchange.	**RW: Explore academic article with HR** **All: Consider engaging with developing a framework**
11	**THANKS AND CLOSE** **Rehema White, University of St Andrews**	

	Contributors and participants were thanked for their attendance and input	

Minutes prepared by Samantha Hartley, EAUC-Scotland Programme Administrator, January 2017